

## APPENDICES

### Appendix 1. Instrument Blueprint

Research Question	Data	Method of Data Collection	Research Instrument	Items adapted
How are the 21 <sup>st</sup> century teaching skills implemented in teaching the English language in Ra'as Island?	The strategies that used by teachers in 21 <sup>st</sup> century teaching skills	Interview and Observation.	Interview guideline and Observation sheet.	Adapted from Facione (1990), Torrance, (2018), Partnership for 21st Century Learning., (2011), and Foster-Fishman et al. (2001)
What are the challenges to implementing 21 <sup>st</sup> Century english teaching skills in Ra'as Island?	The challenges in 21 <sup>st</sup> century teaching skills of English teacher in English language implementation	Interview and Observation.	Interview guideline and Observation sheet.	
What are the mitigations taken by the teachers in implementing 21 <sup>st</sup> Century english teaching skills in Ra'as Island?	The Mitigation in 21 <sup>st</sup> century teaching skills of English teacher in English language implementation	Interview and Observation	Interview guideline and Observation sheet.	

### A. Critical Thinking Skills

Elements	Indicators	Number of Items	Statement(s)
Critical Thinking	Interpretation	1	Using the right strategies in critical thinking implementation
		2	Using the right media for students in critical thinking implementation
		3	Encouraging students in expressing their ideas from various of experiences, etc.
	Analysis	4	Fostering students confident in analyzing the correlation of some issues
		5	Helping students in examining students' analysis in critical thinking skill
	Evaluation	6	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.
		7	Motivating students in reviewing their opinions/ideas' credibility with other experiences, perceptions, and judgments.
	Conclusion	18	Helping students in concluding what they found to strengthen their opinions/ideas.
	Explanation	9	Helping students in confidently explain their opinion/ideas in their own way.
	Self-Regulation	10	Responding their opinion respectfully.
(Other types which not been mentioned above)		11	-

**B. Creativity Skills**

Elements	Indicators	Number of Items	Statement(s)
Creativity	Fluently thinking	1	Using the right strategies in creative skill implementation
		2	Using the right media for students in creative skill implementation.
		3	Encouraging students in producing and creating a large number of ideas.
	Flexible thinking	4	Fostering students confident in generating students' ideas with different approaches and sources.
	Originality	5	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.
	Elaboration	6	Helping students to find their own sources and approaches to strengthen the opinion/ideas.
(Other types which not been mentioned above)		7	-



### C. Communication Skills

Elements	Indicators	Number of Items	Statement(s)
Communication	Delivering	1	Using the right strategies in communication skill implementation.
		2	Using the right media for students in communication skill implementation.
		3	Building fun and interactive classroom to make student active in the classroom
		4	Using the understandable language in the classroom.
	Ethics	5	Listening carefully to students' opinion/ideas.
		6	Respecting student to give their chance to give opinions/ideas.
(Other types which not been mentioned above)		7	-
Total Item		7	

### D. Collaboration Skills

Elements	Indicators	Number of Items	Statement(s)
Collaboration	Collaboration	1	Enhancing students' participation in the classroom.
		2	Contributing their opinion in the collaborative learning with the students.
	Responsibility	3	Building fun and collaborative learning activities.
(Other types which not been mentioned above)		4	-
<b>Total Item</b>		<b>4</b>	

## Appendix 2. Interview Guide

No	Research Topic	Open-Ended Questions
1.	Teachers' Identity	a) What is your name? b) How old are you? c) Can you tell me a little about your educational background? d) How many years have you been teaching in this school? e) Is this your first time to work as a teacher? f) Are you qualified as English teacher?
2.	Critical Thinking (Facione, (1990))	a) Tell me what strategies that you used to increase students' critical thinking skill? b) What are the challenges in using these strategies? c) What did you do to face the challenges? d) Do you analyze students' statement with asking their related opinion/ideas related to the experiences? e) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? f) What did you do to face the challenges? g) How do you manage students to review their opinion? h) Do you often compare and differentiate students' arguments in checking their credibility? i) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? j) What did you do to face the challenges? k) How do you manage students to conclude what the found in their previous activities? l) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? m) What did you do to face the challenges? n) How can you manage students in speaking confidently in front of class? o) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? p) What did you do to face the challenges?
3.	Creativity (Torrance, E. Paul (Ellis Paul), 1915-2003)	a) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' creativity skill? b) What are the challenges in using these strategies? c) How you can manage students to build their ability in producing some ideas with words? d) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? e) What did you do to face the challenges? f) How can you manage students to encourage them in looking other approaches and sources for their ideas?



		g) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? h) What did you do to face the challenges?
		i) How can you manage students to pay attention with their originality? j) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? k) What did you do to face the challenges?
4.	Communications (Partnership for 21st Century Learning. (2011a)).	a) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' communication skill? b) What are the challenges in using these strategies? c) How can you manage students to build their skill in expressing and explaining their ideas? d) How can you manage the students in responding and respecting their friends in delivering their arguments? e) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas? f) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? g) What did you do to face the challenges?
5.	Collaboration (Partnership for 21st Century Learning. (2011b)).	a) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' collaboration skill? b) What are the challenges in using these strategies? c) How can you manage students to build their skill in having effective collaboration with friends in a group? d) How can you manage students in having their responsibility of their own work during the collaborative learning? e) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas in the discussion activities? f) What did you do to face the challenges?

### Appendix 3. Observation Checklist

#### OBSERVATION CHECKLIST

This observation checklist aims to observe the implementation of 21<sup>st</sup>-century teaching skills in rural areas. The category used in this observation checklist is the teachers' frequency of implementing the elements of teaching skills, 21<sup>st</sup> teaching skills (4Cs Skills), challenges, and solutions. This frequency level uses a 1-3 point Likert Scale consisting of never, sometimes, and always. Therefore, the assessment is carried out honestly. 1 consider as no meanwhile the 2&3 consider as yes.

**RQ1:** How are the 21-st century teaching skills (4C) implemented in teaching the English language in Ra'as Island?

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Using the right strategies in critical thinking implementation			
2	Using the right media for students in critical thinking implementation			
3	Encouraging students in expressing their ideas from various of experiences, etc.			
4	Fostering students confident in analyzing the correlation of some issues			
5	Helping students in examining students' analysis in critical thinking skill			
6	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.			
7	Motivating students in reviewing their opinions/ideas' credibility with other experiences, perceptions, and judgments.			
8	Helping students in concluding what they found to strengthen their opinions/ideas.			
9	Helping students in confidently explain their opinion/ideas in their own way.			
10	Responding their opinion respectfully.			
11	(Other types which not been mentioned above)			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Using the right strategies in creative skill implementation			
2	Using the right media for students in creative skill implementation.			
3	Encouraging students in producing and creating a large number of ideas.			

4	Fostering students confident in generating students' ideas with different approaches and sources.			
5	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.			
6	Helping students to find their own sources and approaches to strengthen the opinion/ideas.			
7	. (Other types which not been mentioned above)			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Using the right strategies in communication skill implementation.			
2	Using the right media for students in communication skill implementation.			
3	Building fun and interactive classroom to make student active in the classroom			
4	Using the understandable language in the classroom.			
5	Listening carefully to students' opinion/ideas.			
6	Respecting student to give their chance to give opinions/ideas.			
7	. (Other types which not been mentioned above)			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Enhancing students' participation in the classroom.			
2	Contributing their opinion in the collaborative learning with the students.			
3	Building fun and collaborative learning activities.			
4	. (Other types which not been mentioned above).			

**RQ2: What are the challenges to implementing 21<sup>st</sup> Century English teaching skills in Ra'as Island?**

No Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Educators struggle to determine critical thinking definition and concept.			
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of critical thinking concept			
3	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.			
4	Educators struggle to help students in expressing their ideas in the classroom.			



5	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.			
6	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as passive learning and students, uncomfortable situations.			
7	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.			
8	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering critical thinking concept			
9	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.			
10	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.			

No Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Educators struggle to determine creativity concept.			
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of creativity skills.			
3	Some of educators also often to misunderstand how is the implementation of creativity skills.			
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.			
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of creativity skills.			
6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.			
7	The Educational traditional system is not suitable for improving students' creativity skills.			
8	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process (socio-economic factors).			
9	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as fail of failure, "right answer", lack of creative resources, etc.			
10	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.			

No Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Educators struggle to determine communication concept.			
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of communication skills			
3	Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas			
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.			
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of communication skills.			

6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.			
7	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.			
8	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as students' shyness, lack of confident, and etc.			
9	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.			
10	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering communication skill.			

No Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Educators struggle to determine collaboration concept.			
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of collaboration skills.			
3	Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas			
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.			
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of collaboration skills.			
6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.			
7	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.			
8	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as lack of students' participation, lack of communication, and etc.			
9	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.			
10	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering collaboration skill.			

**RQ3: What are the mitigations taken by the teachers in implementing 21st Century English teaching skills in Ra'as Island?**

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Clarification the concept.			
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of critical thinking.			
3	Creating the comfortable situation and learning environment.			
4	Teachers provide supportive feedback that enriches students' responses.			

5	The dynamic of teaching approaches.			
6	Group discussions.			
7	Applying the real-world contexts.			
8	Question and Answer.			
9	Dynamic assessment (based on the learning process situation).			
10	Non-complex questions for the evaluations.			
11	Incorporating real-life that challenges students to think critically about the learning material.			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Clarification the concept.			
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of creativity skill.			
3	More training & specific school workshops.			
4	Optimizing the available resources.			
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.			
6	Project-based learning (Students-centered learning).			
7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.			
8	Project-based learning, small & specific context projects.			
9	Small test each of learning material			
10	Self-assessment and more flexible in creativity skills.			
11	Small based projects that fit students' economic situations.			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Clarification the concept.			
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of communication skill.			
3	More training & specific school workshops.			
4	Optimizing the available resources.			
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.			
6	Supportive and comfortable classroom environment.			

7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.			
8	Translation-language method (two languages).			
9	Group discussion and presentations.			
10	Role-play and effective communication activities.			
11	Formative assessment (feedback both verbal and non-verbal communication)			

No. Items	Statement(s)	Category		
		1	2	3
1	Clarification the concept.			
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of collaboration skill.			
3	More training & specific school workshops.			
4	Optimizing the available resources.			
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.			
6	Conflict resolution strategies (listening, negotiation, and compromise).			
7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.			
8	Small group collaborative projects with specific responsibilities.			
9	Group discussion and presentations.			
10	Games based on the learning material.			
11	Give and receive the feedback during the collaborative project.			

#### Appendix 4. Expert Judgement Sheets (Interview Guidelines)

Expert Judge Sheets for Interview Guidelines

For: Interview Guidelines

Judge I: Prof. Dr. IGA Lokita Purnamika Utami, S.Pd., MPd.

No	Research Topic	Open-Ended Questions	Relevant	Not Relevant
1.	Teachers' Identity	g) What is your name?	√	
		h) How old are you?	√	
		i) Can you tell me a little about your educational background?	√	
		j) How many years have you been teaching in this school?		
		k) Is this your first time to work as a teacher?		
		l) Are you qualified as English teacher?		
2.	Critical Thinking	q) Tell me what strategies that you used to increase students' critical thinking skill?	√	
		r) What are the challenges in using these strategies?		
		s) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		t) Do you analyze students' statement with asking their related opinion/ideas related to the experiences?	√	
		u) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?		
		v) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		w) How do you manage students to review their opinion?	√	
		x) Do you often compare and differentiate students' arguments in checking their credibility?		
		y) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?		
		z) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		aa) How do you manage students to conclude what the found in their previous activities?	√	



		bb) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? cc) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		dd) How can you manage students in speaking confidently in front of class? ee) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? ff) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
3.	Creativity	l) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' creativity skill? m) What are the challenges in using these strategies? n) How you can manage students to build their ability in producing some ideas with words? o) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? p) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
		q) How can you manage students to encourage them in looking other approaches and sources for their ideas? r) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? s) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
		t) How can you manage students to pay attention with their originality? u) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? v) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
4.	Communications	h) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' communication skill? i) What are the challenges in using these strategies?	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>j) How can you manage students to build their skill in expressing and explaining their ideas?</li> <li>k) How can you manage the students in responding and respecting their friends in delivering their arguments?</li> <li>l) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas?</li> <li>m) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?</li> <li>n) What did you do to face the challenges?</li> </ul>		
5.	Collaboration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>g) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' collaboration skill?</li> <li>h) What are the challenges in using these strategies?</li> <li>i) How can you manage students to build their skill in having effective collaboration with friends in a group?</li> <li>j) How can you manage students in having their responsibility of their own work during the collaborative learning?</li> <li>k) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas in the discussion activities?</li> <li>l) What did you do to face the challenges?</li> </ul>	√	

Singaraja, 26 Maret 2024



Prof. Dr. IGA Lokita Purnamika Utami, S.Pd., MPd  
NIP. 198304022006042001

## Expert Judge Sheets for Interview Guidelines

For: Interview Guidelines

Judge II: Prof. Dr. Ni Komang Arie Suwastini, S.Pd., M.Hum.

No	Research Topic	Open-Ended Questions	Relevant	Not Relevant
1.	Teachers' Identity	m) What is your name?	√	
		n) How old are you?	√	
		o) Can you tell me a little about your educational background?	√	
		p) How many years have you been teaching in this school?		
		q) Is this your first time to work as a teacher?		
		r) Are you qualified as English teacher?		
2.	Critical Thinking	gg) Tell me what strategies that you used to increase students' critical thinking skill?	√	
		hh) What are the challenges in using these strategies?		
		ii) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		jj) Do you analyze students' statement with asking their related opinion/ideas related to the experiences?	√	
		kk) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?		
		ll) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		mm) How do you manage students to review their opinion?	√	
		nn) Do you often compare and differentiate students' arguments in checking their credibility?		
		oo) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?		
		pp) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		qq) How do you manage students to conclude what the found in their previous activities?	√	
		rr) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?		

		ss) What did you do to face the challenges?		
		tt) How can you manage students in speaking confidently in front of class? uu) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? vv) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
3.	Creativity	w) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' creativity skill? x) What are the challenges in using these strategies? y) How you can manage students to build their ability in producing some ideas with words? z) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? aa) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
		bb) How can you manage students to encourage them in looking other approaches and sources for their ideas? cc) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? dd) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
		ee) How can you manage students to pay attention with their originality? ff) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies? gg) What did you do to face the challenges?	√	
4.	Communications	o) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' communication skill? p) What are the challenges in using these strategies?	√	

		<p>q) How can you manage students to build their skill in expressing and explaining their ideas?</p> <p>r) How can you manage the students in responding and respecting their friends in delivering their arguments?</p> <p>s) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas?</p> <p>t) Do you find any challenges in applied these strategies?</p> <p>u) What did you do to face the challenges?</p>		
5.	Collaboration	<p>m) Tell me what are the strategies that you used to increase students' collaboration skill?</p> <p>n) What are the challenges in using these strategies?</p> <p>o) How can you manage students to build their skill in having effective collaboration with friends in a group?</p> <p>p) How can you manage students in having their responsibility of their own work during the collaborative learning?</p> <p>q) How can you manage students to more confident in stating their opinion/ideas in the discussion activities?</p> <p>r) What did you do to face the challenges?</p>	√	

Singaraja, 26 Maret 2024



Prof. Dr. Ni Komang Arie Suwastini, S.Pd., M.Hum.  
NIP.198004042003122001



## Appendix 5. Expert Judgement Sheets (Observation Checklist)

Expert Judge Sheets for Observation Checklist

For: Observation Checklist

Judge I: Prof. Dr. IGA Lokita Purnamika Utami, S.Pd., MPd.

No	Research Topic	Descriptions	Relevant	Not Relevant
1	Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use and apply the right strategies for students in critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Use and apply the right media for students in critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Can enhance students to express the meaning and significance of issues from various experiences, situations, data, events, assessments, habits, customs, beliefs, rules, procedures, or criteria.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students in confidently analyze the actual correlation of some variables in the issues.</li> <li>• Can help student in analyze the actual correlation of some variables in the issues.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can give any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.</li> <li>• Can encourage students to review their opinions/ideas' credibility with other experiences, perceptions, and judgments</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can help students in concluding what they found to strengthen their opinions/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students in confidently explain their opinion/ideas in their own way.</li> <li>• Can deliver their opinions and respond to another opinion with confidence and respect</li> </ul>	√	
2	Challenges in Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to determine critical thinking definition and concept.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of critical thinking concept</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in expressing their ideas in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as passive learning and students, uncomfortable situations.</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering critical thinking concept</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.</li> <li>Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> </ul>	√	
3	Mitigation in Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>Educators narrows and scoop the concept of critical thinking</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators creating the comfortable situation during the learning process</li> <li>Educators provide the supportive feedback which enriches the students' responses</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators find to have adapt their teaching process with the cultural and background factors</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators maximized the used of group discussion strategies in the learning process.</li> <li>Educators used the question and answer not only based on the teaching material but also applying the real-world contexts.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators find to use the dynamic assessment based on the learning process.</li> <li>The non-complex questions and answer for the evaluation.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Incorporating real-life that challenges students to think critically about the learning material.</li> </ul>	√	
4	Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Use and apply the right strategies for students in creativity skills.</li> <li>Use and apply the right media for students in creativity skills.</li> <li>Can boost students' acknowledgement to produce and create a large number of ideas verbally.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Can help students in generating students' ideas with different approaches and sources.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Can encourage students to have their own opinion/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Can help help students to find their own sources and approaches to strengthen the opinion/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
5		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators struggle to determine creativity concept.</li> </ul>	√	

	Challenges in Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Some of educators also often to misunderstand how is the implementation of creativity skills.</li> </ul>		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process (socio-economic factors).</li> </ul>	√	
		Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as fail of failure, "right answer", lack of creative resources, etc.	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> <li>Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.</li> <li>Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> <li>The Educational traditional system is not suitable for improving students' creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
6	Mitigation in Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>Educators narrows and scoop the concept of creativity skills</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators maximized the used of project strategies in the learning process in small scale of task.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educators find to use the dynamic and more flexible of creativity skill.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Incorporating the project to enhance students' independence in the learning situation.</li> </ul>	√	
7	Communications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Use and apply the right strategies for students in communication skills.</li> <li>Use and apply the right media for students in communication skills.</li> <li>Can facilitate students with various communication and opportunities</li> <li>Use the understandable language in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can listen carefully to students' opinion/ideas.</li> <li>• Can respect student to give their chance to give opinions/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
8	Challenges in Communication Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of communication skills</li> <li>• Educators struggle to determine communication concept.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas</li> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as students' shyness, lack of confident, and etc.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of communication skills.</li> </ul>	√	
9	Mitigation in Communication Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of communication skill.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators need to have the supportive and comfortable classroom environment.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators use the translation-language method</li> <li>• Educators use the group discussion</li> <li>• Educators use the role-play and effective communication activities</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to use the dynamic and more flexible of communication skill</li> </ul>	√	
10	Collaboration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students' participation in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can contribute their opinion in the collaborative learning with the students.</li> </ul>		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Teacher is responsible in providing collaboration opportunities.</li> </ul>	√	
11	Challenges in Collaboration Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to determine collaboration concept.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of collaboration skills.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas</li> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of collaboration skills.</li> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as lack of students' participation, lack of communication, and etc.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.</li> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
12	Mitigation in Collaboration Skill	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of collaboration skill</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators need to have the supportive and comfortable classroom environment</li> <li>• Educators use to teach the conflict resolution strategies (listening, negotiation, and compromise)</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators use the collaborative projects</li> <li>• Educators use the game-based learning material</li> <li>• Educators use the group discussion</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators should give direct evaluation</li> </ul>	√	



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Educators used the collaborative project and real-world application</li></ul>		
--	--	---	--	--

Singaraja, 26 Maret 2024



Prof. Dr. IGA Lokita Purnamika Utami, S.Pd., MPd  
NIP. 198304022006042001



## Expert Judge Sheets for Observation Checklist

For: Observation Checklist

Judge II: Prof. Dr. Ni Komang Arie Suwastini, S.Pd., M.Hum.

No	Research Topic	Descriptions	Relevant	Not Relevant
1	Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use and apply the right strategies for students in critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Use and apply the right media for students in critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Can enhance students to express the meaning and significance of issues from various experiences, situations, data, events, assessments, habits, customs, beliefs, rules, procedures, or criteria.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students in confidently analyze the actual correlation of some variables in the issues.</li> <li>• Can help student in analyze the actual correlation of some variables in the issues.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can give any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.</li> <li>• Can encourage students to review their opinions/ideas' credibility with other experiences, perceptions, and judgments</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can help students in concluding what they found to strengthen their opinions/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students in confidently explain their opinion/ideas in their own way.</li> <li>• Can deliver their opinions and respond to another opinion with confidence and respect</li> </ul>	√	
2	Challenges in Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to determine critical thinking definition and concept.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of critical thinking concept</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in expressing their ideas in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as passive learning and students, uncomfortable situations.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering critical thinking concept</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> </ul>	√	
3	Mitigation in Critical Thinking Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of critical thinking</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators creating the comfortable situation during the learning process</li> <li>• Educators provide the supportive feedback which enriches the students' responses</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching process with the cultural and background factors</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators maximized the used of group discussion strategies in the learning process.</li> <li>• Educators used the question and answer not only based on the teaching material but also applying the real-world contexts.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to use the dynamic assessment based on the learning process.</li> <li>• The non-complex questions and answer for the evaluation.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Incorporating real-life that challenges students to think critically about the learning material.</li> </ul>	√	
4	Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use and apply the right strategies for students in creativity skills.</li> <li>• Use and apply the right media for students in creativity skills.</li> <li>• Can boost students' acknowledgement to produce and create a large number of ideas verbally.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can help students in generating students' ideas with different approaches and sources.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can encourage students to have their own opinion/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can help help students to find their own sources and approaches to strengthen the opinion/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	
5	Challenges in Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to determine creativity concept.</li> <li>• Some of educators also often to misunderstand how is the implementation of creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process (socio-economic factors).</li> </ul>	√	
		Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as fail of failure, "right answer", lack of creative resources, etc.	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.</li> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> <li>• The Educational traditional system is not suitable for improving students' creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
6	Mitigation in Creativity Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of creativity skills</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators maximized the used of project strategies in the learning process in small scale of task.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to use the dynamic and more flexible of creativity skill.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Incorporating the project to enhance students' independence in the learning situation.</li> </ul>	√	
7	Communications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use and apply the right strategies for students in communication skills.</li> <li>• Use and apply the right media for students in communication skills.</li> <li>• Can facilitate students with various communication and opportunities</li> <li>• Use the understandable language in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can listen carefully to students' opinion/ideas.</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can respect student to give their chance to give opinions/ideas.</li> </ul>		
8	Challenges in Communication Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of communication skills</li> <li>• Educators struggle to determine communication concept.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas</li> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as students' shyness, lack of confident, and etc.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format</li> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of communication skills.</li> </ul>	√	
9	Mitigation in Communication Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of communication skill.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators need to have the supportive and comfortable classroom environment.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators use the translation-language method</li> <li>• Educators use the group discussion</li> <li>• Educators use the role-play and effective communication activities</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to use the dynamic and more flexible of communication skill</li> </ul>	√	
10	Collaboration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can boost students' participation in the classroom.</li> </ul>	√	



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can contribute their opinion in the collaborative learning with the students.</li> </ul>		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Teacher is responsible in providing collaboration opportunities.</li> </ul>	√	
11	Challenges in Collaboration Implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to determine collaboration concept.</li> <li>• Educators struggle to articulate each of collaboration skills.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas</li> <li>• Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of collaboration skills.</li> <li>• Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as lack of students' participation, lack of communication, and etc.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.</li> <li>• Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering creativity skills.</li> </ul>	√	
12	Mitigation in Collaboration Skill	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators clarify the teaching concept</li> <li>• Educators narrows and scoop the concept of collaboration skill</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators optimize the available resources</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators need to have the supportive and comfortable classroom environment</li> <li>• Educators use to teach the conflict resolution strategies (listening, negotiation, and compromise)</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators find to have adapt their teaching methods or strategies to meet the diverse needs of all students.</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators use the collaborative projects</li> <li>• Educators use the game-based learning material</li> <li>• Educators use the group discussion</li> </ul>	√	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educators should give direct evaluation</li> </ul>	√	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Educators used the collaborative project and real-world application</li></ul>		
--	--	---	--	--

Singaraja, 26 Maret 2024



Prof. Dr. Ni Komang Arie Suwastini, S.Pd., M.Hum.  
NIP.198004042003122001



## Appendix 6. Interview Result

Question	Teacher (#1)	Teacher (#2)	Teacher (#3)
Is it essential to teach the English language in Ra'as Island?	The Foreign language has been a focus of this island for a long time. We teach them very well in Arabic and English. So, if we ask whether it's essential or not, yes, essentially, there's still a lot we need to improve on in the learning process.	It is false if you say it is not essential for the students. As an Arabic and English teacher, I face various difficulties and obstacles regarding human resources and existing facilities. Our school teaches English only once a week, and we use it to maximize students' potential for learning a foreign language. Happening also for the almost the limited time to teaching English language.	Theoretically, upper secondary-level students need English language subjects to prepare for the future. However, let's look at the island's conditions and situation. We need to be given the opportunity and adequate facilities to teach the language that the students need, but we still teach the things we can teach them.
What are the methods that you used as a teacher? What are the obstacles that you faced?	Using two languages (translation method), Maduranese and English (sometimes Indonesian), the reason is they didn't understand fully if the teacher uses English language. They didn't have enough motivation to study when I translated the material into Indonesian or Maduranese language. Games of reward system.	Question and Answer. Reward system (I don't give them the big prize in the classroom, more like the early rest time for students and no homework during the day). So, what I usually do is help them in the initial stages. Like trying to figure out how to solve the problem Sometimes, I use mind mapping for ideas conclusion. I ordered them to write any ideas from what they taught in front of the class and try to find the conclusion.  When we used to give them rewards, they would be less motivated when it was time for homework/monthly tests in the classroom.	Group Games. I often play games inside the classroom to make learning easier. They were often bored when I explained the material that was not functional when it used games.
Is this why the four skills of learning English are not taught?	The way of teaching in this school is, of course, very different from that in cities. The approach towards students is usually what I often do. How about	We can't do various things that schools usually do due to conditions and situations. We at each institution try as much as possible to carry out the mandate to teach every student	They are willing to listen and do homework (PR) assignments or projects, and I'm already grateful. I try to include the aspects

	<p>lesson plans, lesson plans, or other learning documents? Those are existing, but we don't use it here because of that; we adapt to how the students learn here. Skills like grammar, vocabulary, and pronunciation still need to be taught. It is the basis of how to learn the English language. I used the role-play method; it can increase their concentration inside the classroom and expand their knowledge of grammar and pronunciation.</p>	<p>in the institution a foreign language. We still teach, but maybe not as much as other schools, also sometimes, because the lack of teachers, we combine all the students together although in different grades.</p>	<p>needed to complete their knowledge about what you mentioned earlier. The type of tasks that I gave are already in their English book and I used most of their native language as media of communication.</p>
<p>What is the technology that you used in the classroom?</p>	<p>Sometimes the electricity is on during the day, sometimes not, but in 2024, we are trying to make it work and on forever. Computers and LCDs are rarely used because of the fear of increasing electricity costs. In our school, only ten computers are used alternately in ICT subjects. So, English learning is still carried out traditionally or directly. The type of tasks that I gave are already in their English book and I used most of their native language as media of communication. Also, for I often used to exercise their competence in full English, but still translated to the English</p>	<p>Sadly, we don't have any language/computer lab in our school. Therefore, I said earlier that we don't have appropriate facilities to teach students better. There will be one Television inside the classroom, but I confused how to use the television during the learning process.</p>	<p>We used the traditional way of teaching. Sometimes, we use mobile phones inside the classroom (it also depends on the students' smartphone capacity).</p>
<p>How do you increase critical thinking skill competencies?</p>	<p>I love talk and ask opinion to my students with the using of question and answer. The question and</p>	<p>Usually, I use the most straightforward technique, namely question and answer. I invite the students to look at</p>	<p>I always tell about my experience to foster students' sense of giving ideas with asking</p>



	<p>answer also used as one of my last evaluations during the learning process since the causing of limited knowledge of learning assessment.</p> <p>Since the students are in small classroom, maybe in 4-8 students. The discussion will be only in pair.</p> <p>So, what I usually do is help them in the initial stages. Like trying to figure out how to solve the problem, etc. (I used it to have used based on students' learning situation). Although I used Maduranese and Indonesian language, sometimes they were still do not want to answer my questions.</p>	<p>basic phenomena. So, I used it to ask about some of the vocabulary, etc. How I find also some of challenges in managing the meaning of critical thinking in general and how to target students' learning goals. Sometimes passive. Don't expect them to fully answer because the majority will be silent and not say anything. So, usually, I try to point and start talking.</p> <p>Sometimes I don't know how to combine the learning situations between the skills and critical thinking concept.</p>	<p>some related questions to know the students' attention and concluding ideas. They loves to listen story and this trick sometimes can attract students to deliver their ideas. It refers to the teacher-based learning.</p> <p>Also because I'm not the English teacher actually, I'm not that feel confident to teach in front of students.</p> <p>Critical thinking is not always about expressing your opinion well and differently than others in the class. If that is used, it will not be conducive in my class; they will be silent and passive.</p>
How do you improve creativity skill competencies?	<p>The creative side that I teach them is how to combine the opinions and ideas (brainstorming) they think of with the sources they seek (more like creative thinking).</p> <p>I used to have open-ended questions to increase their original thinking and new ideas to solve the problems—straightforward answers (avoid) but used mainly by the students. I don't know how to divide what in creative side that I want to give to the students. Either creative in the ideas and communication or in-terms</p>	<p>It's a bit difficult to regulate the culture and manage the originality. They are better off being silent than explaining something. If forced to answer, they will be likelier to follow the answer afterward. I also sometimes don't know how to do the learning assessment and evaluation.</p> <p>What I usually do, but it is not suitable to continue doing it in every meeting, is to ask them to give ideas/opinions about an incident and write them on paper. Then, I will usually choose one/two random words and ask them to explain in a word or two or maybe more</p>	<p>Due the limited time, I continuing to the previous one in exams or quizzes, for example, I ask them to have short conversations in conversation, so I can see whether it is an idea that came from them or whether they imitate their friends' answers. This could be done to improve their creativity and skill process.</p> <p>During the learning process I used the open-ended questions for asking students the</p>



	of project. I was making them make their own conclusions about the material.	and ordered them to write in the whiteboard, but I rarely do things like this. This is one of the things that actually I do to evaluate the learning process which I struggle before. PJB (project-based learning), insist of creativity and collaboration which I need to maximalize students' background.	related learning material.  I also make it a habit for them to read and look for other sources to give the students many examples and not just rely on books.
How do you improve communication skill competencies?	I usually use conversations. I have downloaded in learning English to teach them examples of conversations in books, or I write them on the blackboard to improve their writing and speaking skills, increasing their communication skills. If they rely only on their social groups in class, they will remain silent and, in the end, will not learn to communicate in English. To help them in learning the vocabularies, I often give them games about vocabularies before we start the learning process, just who can answer as fast as they can will get the reward after.	In terms of communication skills, we all know that they tend to communicate more actively outside the classroom in their local language than inside the school. They tend to be silent in class and seem to avoid the questions I ask. So, what I usually do to "encourage" students to communicate is have the non-judge-mental situation in the learning process.  Having the role-play and to make them more adapt in some English vocabularies, I do some role play which all the conversation had been displayed on their books.	Method: Read one of the conversations in the book, then discuss what it means and make a conversation on the same topic. Usually, they sometimes make models that are 80% the same as in the book, but that's okay because I respect their learning process more.
How do we improve collaboration skill competencies?	They were engaging in their (most) activities in role-play review while discussing some complex vocabularies and parts of grammar that were used. It's too difficult for them to compose a storyline in English, but I still teach them to (direct direction and instruction), starting from making sentences (short to long) in because	For the upper middle class, I expect students to work on various projects I have set. In this case, I also had to adjust their abilities and the limited resources we had. Don't bother those who 80% are incapable students by not involving their difficulties.  In objectives, I also sometimes don't know how to do the learning assessment and	In class, they enjoy connecting with friends and forming groups because they have activities with friends. I usually do think in pair and share, or small projects that involve English language subjects and other subjects.

	<p>sometimes they not have enough motivation to do the collaboration group</p> <p>Because the number of students are in small number, it is always difficult when we try to have the large number activities group &gt;&gt; each of students to have the group roles &amp; small group collaborative projects.</p>	<p>evaluation in a group task because they come with different skills but in group projects.</p> <p>There's nothing we can do if the class are maintaining with the difference class and group because the lack of teachers.</p>	
<p>How are your strategies in your English language learning to maintain their activities inside the classroom?</p>	<p>My strategy is not only in the classroom. As a teacher, I and several of my friends have made various efforts to increase their awareness of language learning, such as by having a language boarding school or tutoring at reasonable costs, but the fact that one of the biggest problems is in students who think they don't need to learn foreign language. They felt exhausted when they still did some learning outside school.</p>	<p>I order them to work as a team. Working more in groups will make them more active in class, so I usually use group strategies to organize the learning course or if they want to do independent learning. I will ask them to take notes that will be given on the blackboard.</p> <p>Independent learning without my guarding in the classroom makes the students too lazy to do the task that I gave.</p>	<p>My strategy is always simple, I will give them material in class, and I will teach it for a few minutes (usually, if it takes a long time, they will get bored quickly), and give them questions, and they will answer them. If not by pointing, I will usually trick the students into singing games by going around the items they have.</p>

## Appendix 7. Thematic Analysis Table

Supporting Quotes	Codes “Keywords”	Sub-theme	Theme
"Usually, I use the most straightforward technique, namely, question and answer."	<div>Question-and-Answer</div> <div>Brainstorming</div>	<div>Inquiry-based Learning</div>	Strategies
"I love talking and asking opinions from my students by using questions and answers."			
"I always tell about my experience to foster students' sense of giving ideas by asking some related questions to capture the students' attention."			
"I used to have open-ended questions to increase their original thinking and new ideas to solve the problems. "			
"During the learning process? I used the open-ended questions to ask students about the related learning material. "			
"Question and Answer. Reward system. I don't give them the big prize in the classroom. Instead, I offer early rest time for students and no homework during the day."			
"The creative side that I teach them is how to combine the opinions and ideas they think of with the sources they seek, more like creative thinking."			
"Identifying problems or digesting problem conditions is one of the parts of critical thinking that is most difficult to pursue in forming essential thinking."			
"I ask them to have short conversations in conversation, so I can see whether it is an idea that came from them or whether they imitate their friends' answers by open-ended questions. "			
"What I usually do, but it is not suitable to continue doing it in every meeting, is to ask them to give ideas/opinions about an incident and write them on paper."			
"They love to listen to stories, and this trick sometimes can attract students to deliver and conclude their ideas."			
"I ordered them to make small projects to better understand how important group participation."	Project-based learning	Collaborative Learning	

"I usually do think in pairs and share, or small projects that involve English language subjects and other subjects."	Group Discussion		
"I usually use group strategies to organize the learning course, or if they want to do independent learning."			
"Since the students are in a small classroom, maybe with 4-8 students. The discussion will be conducted in pairs only."			
"Working in a group/team makes students less active in the group and more inactive than before."			
"I will use two languages (translation method): Maduranese, English, and Indonesian. They did not fully understand whether the teacher used the English language."	Mixed Language	Bilingual Approach	
"I used more in Maduranese and Indonesian language than the English language itself."			
"The type of tasks that I gave are already in their English book, and I used most of their native language as a medium of communication."	Audio (translated) Analysis		
"I usually use conversations. I have downloaded Learning English to teach them examples of conversation in books."			
"Group Games. I often play games inside the classroom to make learning easier."	Games	Interactive Activities	
"They were engaging in their activities in role-play review while discussing some complex vocabulary and parts of grammar that were used."	Role-Play		
"Read one of the conversations in the book, then discuss what it means and have a conversation on the same topic."	Writing Task		
"Continuing to the previous one, in exams or quizzes, for example, I ask them to have short conversations so I can see whether it is an idea that came from them or whether they imitate their friends' answers."			
"What I usually do, but it is not suitable to continue doing it in every meeting, is to ask them to give ideas/opinions about an incident and write them on paper. Then, I will usually choose one or two random			



words and ask them to explain in a word or two, or maybe more, and order them to write the words on the whiteboard. "			
"Lesson plan and any other course document exists but the teacher seldom to uses it."			
"We cannot do various things that schools usually do due to conditions and situations. At each institution, we strive as much as possible to fulfil our mandate of teaching every student a foreign language. We still teach, but maybe not as much as other schools, also sometimes, because of the lack of teachers, we combine all the students, although in different grades."	Lack of Classroom Management		
"It's hard to divide students into groups when the class only has five children."	Small-number of students	Instructional Knowledge	
"Due to the limited time, I will continue with the previous one in exams or quizzes."	Time Constraint		
"I also find some challenges in managing the meaning of critical thinking in general and how to target students' learning goals, but I do not know how to do the learning assessment and evaluation."	Learning evaluation		
"But I rarely do things like this. This is one of the things I do to evaluate the learning process, which I struggled with before."			
"It is difficult to regulate the culture and manage the originality. They are better off being silent than explaining something."	Lack of Training	Teachers' Knowledge	
"The question and answer are also used as one of my last evaluations during the learning process due to limited knowledge of learning assessment and evaluation."	Limited Knowledge		
"Sometimes I do not know how to combine the learning situations between the skills and critical thinking concept, and also find some challenges in managing the meaning of critical thinking in general, and how to target students' learning goals."	Limited Knowledge Lack of teachers' confidence	Teachers' Knowledge	
"Also, because I am not an English teacher, I am not confident to teach in front of students."			
"Sometimes passive. Do not expect them to fully answer, as the majority will remain	Lack of confidence		

Challenges



silent and refrain from speaking. So, usually, I try to point and start talking."			
"Critical thinking is not always about expressing your opinion well and differently than others in the class. If that is used, it will not be conducive in my class. They will be silent and passive."	Lack of confidence Shyness	Students' Engagement	
"Although I used Maduranese and Indonesian languages, sometimes they still did not want to answer my questions."			
When it comes to communication, the students felt more pressure. They seem afraid to speak because of the limited vocabulary and are not confident."			
"Students here are very shy to speak in front of others, especially in English."			
"It is too difficult for them to do a direct project in the classroom because sometimes they do not have enough motivation to do the collaboration group."	Lack of Motivation		
"For the upper middle class, I expect students to work on various projects I have set. In this case, I also had to adjust their abilities and our limited resources."	Limited Resources		
"We used the traditional way of teaching. Some of the students already had a smartphone, but still we never used it for learning a language."	Limited Resources Limited Learning Materials	Technology Integration	
"Sometimes the electricity is on during the day, sometimes not, but in 2024, we are trying to make it work and stay on forever. Computers and LCDs are rarely used due to concerns about increasing electricity costs. In our school, only ten computers are used alternately in ICT subjects. So, English learning is still carried out traditionally or directly."			
"Sometimes passive. Do not expect them to fully answer, as the majority will remain silent and not say anything. So, usually, I try to point and start talking."			
"So, what I usually do to encourage students to communicate is have a non-judgmental situation in the learning process. When I ordered the students to	Contextual Adaptation Using the available material	Learning Approaches	Mitigation

answer, I always say that there is no wrong answer, come to the front with confidence."			
"There is nothing we can do if the class are maintaining with the difference class and group because the lack of teachers".			
"Because the number of students is small, it is always difficult when we try to have the large activities group, each of students to have the group roles & small group collaborative projects."			
"The type of tasks that I gave are already in their English book and I used most of their native language as media of communication."			
"We need to be given the opportunity and adequate facilities to teach the language that the students need, but we still teach the things we can teach them."			
"I always tell my students about my experiences to boost their' sense of giving and concluding ideas. They love to listen to stories, and this trick can sometimes attract students to share their ideas. It used to minimize the use of technology."	Story-telly (Teacher-centred)		
"I invite the students to look at the phenomena around the island. So, I used it to ask about some of the vocabulary, etc."	Games		
"Give ideas/opinions about an incident and write them on paper. Then, I will usually choose one/two random words and ask them to explain in a word or two or maybe more."	Writing Activity		
"Reward system (I don't give them the big prize in the classroom, more like the early rest time for students and no homework during the day)."	Reward system		
"The question and answer were also used as one of my last evaluations during the learning process."	Question-and-Answer		
"Due to the limited time, I continue to the previous one in exams or quizzes, for example, I ask them to have short conversations."	Question-and-Answer	Non-complex learning evaluation	

## Appendix 8. Observation Checklist Result

**RQ1: How are the 21st-century teaching skills (4C) implemented in English language teaching in Ra'as Island?**

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Using the right strategies in critical thinking implementation	√	√	
2	Using the right media for students in critical thinking implementation	√	√	
3	Encourage students in expressing their ideas from various of experiences, etc.	√	X	
4	Boost students confident in analyzing the correlation of some issues	√	X	
5	Helping students in examining students' analysis in critical thinking skill	X	X	
6	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.	√	√	
7	Motivating students in reviewing their opinions/ideas' credibility with other experiences, perceptions, and judgments.	X	X	
8	Helping students in concluding what they found to strengthen their opinions/ideas.	√	√	
9	Helping students in confidently explain their opinion/ideas in their own way.	√	√	
10	Responding their opinion respectfully.	√	√	
11	(Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Using the right strategies in creative skill implementation	√	√	
2	Using the right media for students in creative skill implementation.	√	√	
3	Encourage students in producing and creating a large number of ideas.	X	X	
4	Boost students confident in generating students' ideas with different approaches and sources.	√	√	
5	Giving any evaluation to students' opinion/ideas.	X	X	
6	Helping students to find their own sources and approaches to strengthen the opinion/ideas.	√	√	
7	. (Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Using the right strategies in communication skill implementation.	√	√	
2	Using the right media for students in communication skill implementation.	√	√	
3	Building fun and interactive classroom to make student active in the classroom	X	X	
4	Using the understandable language in the classroom.	√	√	
5	Listening carefully to students' opinion/ideas.	√	√	
6	Respecting student to give their chance to give opinions/ideas.	√	√	
7	. (Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Enhancing students' participation in the classroom.	√	√	
2	Contributing their opinion in the collaborative learning with the students.	√	X	
3	Building fun and collaborative learning activities.	√	√	

**RQ2: What are the challenges to implementing 21st Century English teaching skills in Ra'as Island?**

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Educators struggle to determine critical thinking definition and concept.	X	√	
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of critical thinking concept	X	√	
3	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.	√	√	
4	Educators struggle to help students in expressing their ideas in the classroom.	√	√	
5	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.	√	√	
6	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as passive learning and students, uncomfortable situations.	√	√	
7	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.	X	X	

8	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering critical thinking concept	X	X	
9	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of critical thinking skills.	√	√	
10	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.	X	X	
11	(Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Educators struggle to determine creativity concept.	√	√	
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of creativity skills.	√	√	
3	Some of educators also often to misunderstand how is the implementation of creativity skills.	√	√	
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.	X	√	
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of creativity skills.	√	√	
6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.	X	X	
7	The Educational traditional system is not suitable for improving students' creativity skills.	√	√	
8	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process (socio-economic factors).	√	√	
9	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as fail of failure, "right answer", lack of creative resources, etc.	√	√	
10	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.	X	X	
11	(Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Educators struggle to determine communication concept.	X	X	
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of communication skills	X	X	



3	Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas	X	X	
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.	X	X	
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of communication skills.	√	√	
6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.	X	X	
7	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.	√	√	
8	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as students' shyness, lack of confident, and etc.	√	√	
9	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.	X	X	
10	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering in communication skill.	X	X	
11	(Other types which not been mentioned above)	-	-	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Educators struggle to determine collaboration concept.	X	X	
2	Educators struggle to articulate each of collaboration skills.	X	X	
3	Educators struggle to help students in clarifying their ideas	√	X	
4	Educators struggle to varying students' level during the learning process.	√	√	
5	Lack of resources and support that needs for develop the learning of collaboration skills.	√	√	
6	Educators difficult to integrates their management in learning process such as time limitations, curriculum, classroom concept, group number of students and many others.	X	X	
7	Educators sometimes hard to handle the students' different aspects during the learning process.	√	√	
8	Educators struggle to overcome some of students' issues such as lack of students' participation, lack of communication, and etc.	√	√	
9	Educators hard to assess the evaluations in a traditional/non digital test format.	X	X	
10	Educators hard to determine what assess format which suitable for their method in fostering collaboration skill.	X	X	

**RQ3: What are the mitigations taken by the teachers in implementing 21st Century English teaching skills in Ra'as Island?**

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Clarification the concept.	X	√	
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of critical thinking.	X	√	
3	Creating the comfortable situation and learning environment.	√	√	
4	Teachers provide supportive feedback that enriches students' responses.	X	X	
5	The dynamic of teaching approaches.	√	√	
6	Group discussions.	X	X	
7	Applying the real-world contexts.	√	√	
8	Question and Answer.	X	X	
9	Dynamic assessment (based on the learning process situation).	√	√	
10	Non-complex questions for the evaluations.	√	√	
11	Incorporating real-life that challenges students to think critically about the learning material.	X	X	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Clarification the concept.	X	X	
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of creativity skill.	X	X	
3	More training & specific school workshops.	X	X	
4	Optimizing the available resources.	√	√	
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.	√	√	
6	Project-based learning (Students-centered learning).	√	√	
7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.	√	√	
8	Project-based learning, small & specific context projects.	√	√	
9	Small test each of learning material	X	X	
10	Self-assessment and more flexible in creativity skills.	√	√	
11	Small based projects that fit students' economic situations.	√	√	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Clarification the concept.	X	X	
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of communication skill.	X	X	
3	More training & specific school workshops.	X	X	
4	Optimizing the available resources.	√	√	
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.	√	√	
6	Supportive and comfortable classroom environment.	√	√	
7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.	√	√	
8	Translation-language method (two languages).	√	√	
9	Group discussion and presentations.	√	√	
10	Role-play and effective communication activities.	√	√	
11	Formative assessment (feedback both verbal and non-verbal communication)	√	√	

Items	Statement(s)	T1	T2	T3
1	Clarification the concept.	X	X	
2	Narrowing/scooping the concept of collaboration skill.	X	X	
3	More training & specific school workshops.	X	X	
4	Optimizing the available resources.	√	√	
5	Optimizing the dynamic resources.	√	√	
6	Conflict resolution strategies (listening, negotiation, and compromise).	√	√	
7	Adjusting their teaching methods to meet the diverse needs of all students.	√	√	
8	Small group collaborative projects with specific responsibilities.	√	√	
9	Group discussion and presentations.	√	√	
10	Games based on the learning material.	X	X	
11	Give and receive the feedback during the collaborative project.	√	√	

## Appendix 9. Documentation





